

Regarding the definitions of each of the six clairvoyances, someone posits the following definitions:

1. The definition of the clairvoyance of magical emanation is: That which depends on its empowering condition an actual concentration and is concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom, which are able to move the earth, transform into one, emanate many, and so forth.
2. The definition of the clairvoyance of a celestial ear is: That which depends on its empowering condition an actual concentration and is concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom, which know exactly the coarse and subtle sounds of the world system.
3. The definition of the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds is: That which depends on its empowering condition an actual concentration and is concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom, which directly know others' minds that have attachment, that are free from attachment, and so forth.
4. The definition of the clairvoyance of recalling former lives is: That which depends on its empowering condition an actual concentration and is concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom, which remember a hundred, a thousand, etc. former lives of oneself and others.
5. The definition of the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is: That which depends on its empowering condition an actual concentration and is concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom, which directly perceive the coarse and subtle forms of the world system.
6. The definition of the clairvoyance of the removal of defilements is: That which depends on its empowering condition an actual concentration and is concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom, which directly know either the means to eliminating the two obstructions or the elimination [of the two obstructions].

The first definition is not correct because a clairvoyance of magical emanation that *is* the mental factor of wisdom accords with the definiendum but not with the definition. A clairvoyance of magical emanation that *is* the mental factor of wisdom accords with the definiendum because it is a clairvoyance of magical emanation. However a clairvoyance of magical emanation that is the mental factor of wisdom does not accord with the definition because it is not concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom. It is not concomitant with meditative stabilization and wisdom because it is not concomitant with wisdom. It is not concomitant with wisdom because it *is* wisdom.

Furthermore, a main mind that is *concomitant* with a clairvoyance of magical emanation accords with the definition, but not with the definiendum. A main mind that is concomitant with a clairvoyance of magical emanation accords with the definition because a clairvoyance of magical emanation accords with the definition and because that main mind is concomitant with a clairvoyance of magical emanation by way of five similarities.

However, a main mind that is concomitant with a clairvoyance of magical emanation does not accord with the definiendum because it is not a clairvoyance of magical emanation. A main mind that is concomitant with a clairvoyance of magical emanation is not a clairvoyance of magical emanation because it is not a mental factor. It is not a mental factor because it is a main mind.

The same criticism of the first definition also applies to the next four definitions.

The sixth definition is not correct because a clairvoyance of the removal of defilements that is the mental factor of wisdom accords with the definiendum but not with the definition.

Furthermore, a clairvoyance of the removal of defilements in the continuum of a Hearer Arhat is a clairvoyance of the removal of defilements but it does not accord with the definition. It does not accord with the definition because it does not directly know either the means to eliminating the two obstructions or the elimination [of the two obstructions]. It does not know those two because it does not directly know the Mahayana truth of the path or the Mahayana truth of cessation.

It is important to understand that the means to eliminating the two obstructions refers to the Mahayana truth of the path that eliminates the two obstructions, and the elimination of the two obstructions refers to the Mahayana truth of cessation. The means to eliminating the two obstructions (i.e. the Mahayana truth of the path that eliminates the two obstructions) and the

elimination of the two obstructions (i.e. the Mahayana truth of cessation) are found in the continuum of a Bodhisattva but not in the continuum of a Hearer Arhat.

In the continuum of a Hearer Arhat only the means to eliminating the afflictive obstructions (i.e. the Hinayana truth of the path) and the elimination of the afflictive obstructions (i.e. the Hinayana cessation) are found.

- Regarding the above six definitions someone posited, another person says: "Those definitions are not correct because if one attains any of the six clairvoyances one does not have to attain an actual concentration."

Our reply is that this not correct because in order to attain of the six clairvoyances one necessarily must have attained an actual concentration.

- Regarding the clairvoyance of a celestial eye, someone asserts: "The uncommon empowering condition of the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is a physical nose sense power."

This is not correct because the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is not a nose consciousness. The clairvoyance of a celestial eye is not a nose consciousness because it is not a sense consciousness. It is not a sense consciousness because it is a clairvoyance.

(Please note that if the *uncommon* empowering condition of an awareness is a nose sense power, the awareness is necessarily a nose consciousness.)

Furthermore, the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is not a sense consciousness because it is a mental consciousness. If you say that the reason is not established, i.e. that the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is not a mental consciousness, our reply is that the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is a mental consciousness because it arose from its uncommon empowering condition a *mental sense power*.

(Please note that if the *uncommon* empowering condition of an awareness is a mental sense power, the awareness is necessarily a mental consciousness.)

- Regarding the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds, someone holds: "If something is the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds it is necessarily clairvoyant with respect to whatever mind there is."
- Someone else argues: "This is not correct because whatever is the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds is not necessarily clairvoyant with respect to all kinds of others' minds. It is not clairvoyant with respect to all kinds of others' minds because it does not know all kinds of thought of others' minds. It does not know all kinds of thought of others' minds because it does not know *all* the thoughts of others' minds. It does not know all the thoughts of others' minds because if it were to know all the thoughts of others' minds it would know all the thoughts of a Buddha. However, the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds in the continua of sentient beings cannot know all the thoughts of a Buddha."
- Regarding the level of the six clairvoyances, someone says: "There are six clairvoyances that pertain to the Formless Realm."

This is not correct because whatever is any of the six clairvoyances is necessarily an actual concentration and thus pertains to the Form Realm. Whatever is any of the six clairvoyances is necessarily an actual concentration because whatever is any of the six clairvoyances necessarily has as its mental basis an actual concentration. Whatever is any of the six clairvoyances necessarily has as its mental basis an actual concentration because Asanga says in his

Compendium of Manifest Knowledge (Abhidharmasamuccaya):

Whether someone is a non-Buddhist, a Hearer, a Bodhisattva or a Tathagata, the [four] Immeasurables are obtained in dependence on any of the four pure concentrations. And the five clairvoyances are like the [four] Immeasurables [obtained in dependence on any of the four concentrations].

